BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06100297 8

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

DISCRIMINATION LAW:

EQUALITY IN THE PRIVATE SECTOR

2009-2010

Volume 2

Professor Denise Réaume

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

OCT 16 2009

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

DISCRIMINATION LAW:

EQUALITY IN THE PRIVATE SECTOR

2009-2010

Volume 2

Professor Denise Réaume

Thanks are due to Eric Bruce and Megan Evans Maxwell for help updating and reorganizing these materials.

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/discriminationla02raum

DISCRIMINATION LAW:
EQUALITY IN THE PRIVATE SECTOR

2009-2010

Table of Contents

Volume 2

PART II: THE STRUCTURE OF A DISCRIMINATION COMPLAINT cont'd

4. SPHERES WITHIN WHICH DISCRIMINATION IS PROHIBITED

A. Employment

Sharma v. Yellow Cab 307

Nixon v. Vancouver Rape Relief Society 314

Andrews v. Chilli House Thai Bistro 319

B. Services

Nixon v. Vancouver Rape Relief Society 323

Konieczna v. Owners Strata Plan NW2489 (No. 2) 325

Gould v. Yukon Order of Pioneers 328

Marine Drive Golf Club v. Buntain 351

British Columbia v. Crockford 357

Braithwaite v. Ontario (Attorney General) (No.1) 362

Note: *Cooper*; *Forward* 365

5. THE GROUNDS APPROACH: INTERPRETING THE ENUMERATED GROUNDS

Note 367

A. Prohibited Grounds of Discrimination:

i. Disability

Ontario Human Rights Commission v. Vogue Shoes 367

Davison v. St Paul Lutheran Home of Melville, Sask. 378

Note: *Nahal*; *Evans*; *Mercier*; *Critch* 381

ii. Sex

Québec (Comm. des droits de la personne et des droits de la jeunesse) c. Maison des jeunes À-Ma-Baie Inc. (No 2).....382

Note.....386

Vancouver Rape Relief Society v. British Columbia.....386

iii. Family Status

Canada (Attorney General) v. Mossop.....391

B. v. Ontario (Human Rights Commission).....404

iv. Religion

Syndicat Northcrest v. Amselem.....412

Note.....420

B. Of Pigeonholes and Principles

Note.....421

Egan v. Canada.....421

Nitya Iyer, "Categorical Denials: Equality Rights and the Shaping of Social Identity".....426

Note: *Vriend v. Alberta*.....433

Note: *Arzem v. Ontario* (No. 1&6).....434

6. HARD CASES: CONNECTING THE ELEMENTS IN A COMPLAINT

A. The Perception Issue

*Québec (Commission des droits) v. Montreal (**Mercier**)*.....439

Rogal v. Dalgliesh.....443

Entrop v. Imperial Oil.....446

Note: *Alberta v. Kellog Brown Root*.....447

*Newfoundland (Human Rights Commission) v. Health Care Corp. (**Evans**)*.....449

B. Treatment 'as though'

Note.....455

Jubran v. Board of Trustees.....455

North Vancouver School District No. 44 v. Jubran (B.C.S.C.).....458

Note.....459

North Vancouver School District No. 44 v. Jubran (B.C.C.A.).....460

7. "REASONABLE" ACCOMMODATION/"UNDUE" HARDSHIP

A. Starting Points

Note 467

Central Okanagan School District No. 23 v. *Renaud* 467

B.C. (Superintendent of Motor Vehicles) v. B.C. (Council of Human Rights) ***(Grismer)*** 472

B. Undue Hardship

i. Safety

Pannu v. Skeena Cellulose.....479

Note: *Oak Bay Marina v. B.C. (H.R.T.)* 490

ii. Interests of Other Employees

Re Dominion Colour Corp. 492

Bubb-Clarke v. TTC (No. 3) 506

Kavanagh v. Canada (Attorney General) (CHRT) 508

Canada (Attorney General) v. Canada (HRC.) and Kavanagh (Fed.Ct.).....513

iii. Cost Arguments

Howard v. University of British Columbia.....516

Note: *Turnbull v. Famous Players Inc* 521

iv. All of the above

Ontario Human Rights Commission v. Ford Motor Company ***(Roosma)***.....523

8. RECENT TRENDS

Note 535

Ontario Nurses Association v. Orillia Soldiers Memorial Hospital et al. 536

BCGSEU v. BC ***(McAllister)***.....548

McGill University Health Centre 551

Note: *Hydro- Québec*.....559

Bastide v. Canada Post.....562

Nixon v. Vancouver Rape Relief Society 565

Note: *Gwinner, Wignall, Marakkaparambil*.....570

Ontario (AG) v. Ontario Human Rights Commission (**Braithwaite**) 578
Alberta v. Alberta 586
Note: *Pasternak, Stopps* 596

9. CASE STUDY

B.C. v. Hutchinson (No.4)(BCHRT).....599
B.C. v. Hutchinson (No. 2) (BCSC).....646

10. REMEDIES

A. The Individual Complaint Model

Hawkes v. Brown's Ornamental Iron Works.....671
Torres v. Royalty Kitchenware Ltd.....672
Tarnopolsky and Pentney, *Discrimination and the Law* 685
Cameron v. Nel-Gor Castle Nursing Home.....688
Fuller v. Daoud.....693
Whitehead v. Servodyne Canada Ltd.....700
Note: Piazza v. Airport Taxicab 702
Cashin v. C.B.C. (No.2) 703
Canada (Attorney General) v. Morgan 709
Liquor Control Board (Ont.) v. Karumanchiri.....717
Quebec v. Communauté urbaine de Montréal (**Larocque**) 722

B. Systemic Remedies

William Black, *Employment Equality: A Systemic Approach*.....727
Robichaud v. The Queen.....730
McKinnon v. Ontario (Ministry of Correctional Services) (No. 3) 735
Note: *McKinnon v. Ontario (Ministry of Correctional Services) No.7* 742
Note: *Ontario (Ministry of Correctional Services) v. Ontario (HRC) No. 4*.....746
Ontario (Ministry of Correctional Services) v. Ontario (HRC) No.8 748
Note 754
Note: *Ontario (MCS) v. Ontario (HRC) No 14* 755
Action Travail Des Femmes v. C.N.R. Co. 757
Note 772

PART IV: THE SPREAD OF HUMAN RIGHTS ADJUDICATION

11. THE COMPETING FORA ISSUE

Note 773
Parry Sound v. OPSEU 773
Note: *Weber v. Ontario Hydro: Morin: Charette* 778
Tranchemontagne v. Ontario 782
Etherington, "Promises, Promises" 788